# IN THE SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA HOLDEN AT ABUJA

# ON FRIDAY, THE 29TH DAY OF JANUARY, 2016

## BEFORE THEIR LORDSHIPS

NWALI SYLVESTER NGWUTA
MARY UKAEGO PETER-ODILI
OLUKAYODE ARIWOOLA
MUSA DATITIO MUHAMMAD
IOHN INYANG OKORO

IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT

SC. 37/2015

## BETWEEN:

1. EJIKE OGUEBEGO

2. HON. CHUKS OKOYE

(Chairman P.D.P. Anambra State and
Legal Adviser PDP Anambra State Chapter
respectively, suing for themselves and on
behalf of the other members of the State
Executive Committee of the PDP Anambra State)

APPELLANTS

## AND

- 1. PEOPLES DEMOCRATIC PARTY
- 2. INDEPENDENT NATIONAL ELECTORAL COMMISSION (INEC)

CHUKWUDI OKASIA

RESPONDENTS

## <u>JUDGMENT</u>

(Delivered by JOHN INYANG OKORO, JSC)

This is an appeal against the judgment of the Court of Appeal, Abuja Division delivered on the 6th of February,

there any dispute that the Federal High Court made an order directing the 1st and 2nd respondents to recognize the appellants as Executive members of the PDP in Anambra State? The answer is No. Secondly, is there any dispute that the 2nd respondent wrote Exhibit E recognizing the 1st appellant and his executive committee members, as ordered by the court? Again, the answer is No. Thirdly, is there any dispute the fact that the 1st respondent reacted negatively by setting up a caretaker committee in spite of the order of the Federal High Court? The answer is No. So, what are we talking about? The issue before the trial court was whether the 1st respondent can rubbish judgment/order of the court for whatever reason and set up a caretaker committee, other claims notwithstanding. For me, I strongly hold the view that there is no dispute on the relevant/essential facts granting the claims of the appellants which relate to the determination/interpretation of the action of the 1st

respondent in setting up a caretaker committee of the PDP Anambra State Chapter during the pendency of the judgment/order of the Federal High Court recognizing the appellants as persons duly elected to that position. See Famfa Oil Ltd V. Attorney-General of the Federation (2003) 18 NWLR (pt. 852) 453, Doherty V. Doherty (1968) NWLR 241, Habib Bank Nig. Ltd V. Ochete (2001) 3 NWLR (pt. 699) 114. Jer V. Iyortom (2014) 14 NWLR (pt. 1428) 575 at 627 – 628.

The 1st and 3rd respondents have tried to raise issues which tend to show that there are conflicts as to facts. I do not see any. Those facts which seem to cause disputes are not relevant to the determination of the main issue before the court.

As it stands it is clear that the court below premised its decision on this issue on a wrong appreciation of the claim of the appellants before the trial Federal High Court. I hold therefore, that Originating Summons was properly used to commence this suit at the Federal High

Jurt. This issue is resolved in favour of the appellants.

Having resolved all the five issues in favour of the appellants, I hold that there is merit in this appeal which is hereby allowed. The judgment of the Court of Appeal is hereby set aside. The order of the Federal High Court in Suit No FHC/PH/CS/213/2013) (now Suit No. FHC/AWK/CS/247/2013) recognizing the Ejike Oguebego – led Executive Committee of the People's Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter is still subsisting until it is set aside by an order of court. I award costs of N100,000.00 against the 1st and 3rd respondents in favour of the appellants.

APPEAL ALLOWED.

JOHN INYANG OKORO, JUSTICE, SUPREME COURT

CERTIFIED TRUE CONTROL Sign.
Date
Suppose Control

52

# Anax1

## SENATORIAL 2015 LIST

			2111773 177AD	F	ACCORD	42	WASC
<del>-</del>	ANAMBRA L	ANAMBRA NORTH	MBAKWE ESTHER CHIBUZOR	М	APGA	- 53	B.SC
2	AL LO KILLING	SDAHVAN	CHUKWU-DUBEM ANTHONY OBAZE	F	ADC	46	WASC
		nd star at the sta	NWOKORA UCHENNA	M	NE	54	OND, B.SC
3	A STATE OF THE PERSON NAMED IN COLUMN TWO IS NOT THE OWNER.	Like (2) productive Community and Community and Adult Spaces.	HON, RALPH U. OKEREKE	M	CPP	37	WAEC
4 5			MOUKWE CLELESTINE C.	M	//ID	-	SSCE
		San Laboration (1997)	NDIFE FRANKLINE L	F	KOWA	40	NCE
6	***************************************	- 194 Control of the	MONEKE OKUKWEKA C.	M	LP:	49.	SSCE
7	***************************************	to the second	DUMAKA VICTOR DAVID OKOLO	- M	NCP -	36-1	BSC
8			TOCHUKWU JAMES IKWUEMEZI	M	PDC	48	WASC
9	with the same of t	and the state of t	EZINANDO ARTHUR NNAMDI	M	PDP	52	M.BA
0	- Lat	COURT ORDER	LIONN OKECHUK WU EMEKA	M	PPA	52	WASC
1		the second section of the section of the second section of the section of the second section of the secti	THOMADINGERI JOHN CHUKWUDUZIE	M	UPP	42	SSCE
12	TO THE PARTY OF TH	and the second property and second and desired to the second seco	NWACHUKWU AUGUSTINE NNAMDI	here adjugation of the	2/1/		
13		The second of the store of the second of the	and the state of t				The second secon
	And the state of the first of the state of t		CHIEF (SIR) VICTOR UMEH	M	APGA	52	B.SC
1		ANAMBRA CENTRAL	CHURWUNONYELUM UMEH, OFR, KSI	-	ACCORD	45	NCE, B.ED
		SD/011/AN	OYEH MERCY LICITE	F	ACD	52	GCE
2			HON ORY KATE OKAFOR		ADC	37	WAEC
3		The state of the s	CHIEF ANAYO AUGUSTINE NWEKE	M	APC	62	MBBS
4		etter til state	SEN. (DR.) CHRIS N. NOIGE	M	+ ACC	1	E 17. 2
5	-	والمناول والمناول والمناول فيلم فيتم في المناول والمناول والمناول والمناول والمناول والمناول والمناول والمناول	CHRISTOPHER AKUDO C.U.	M	CPP	54	MBA
6	, ,		CHUKWENDU	· M	+ ID	No.	B.SC
	The second secon	gang - pang rings made of residence and ref films - (in our retirement), proceedings of the pange of the pange of the	OKAFOR IKECHUKWU	M	KOWA	50	WAEC
7		A resident to the second secon	CHIEF DENNIS N.F. OGUGUO	M	LP	48	LLB, BL
\$	1	and the second s	TKINGSLEY CHUKWUMA NWOFUK	M	MPPP	37	LLB, BL
9		40.46 margin 124 miles - 124 m	TEKWEOZOH CHRISTOPHER NKEM	- ANTENNANTE OF THE PARTY OF TH	NCP	40	BSC
10	-	the state of the s	TYPANAMA IERONE IKENNA	M	PDC	41	WASC, DIP.
11			REV. CHARLES ONYEKACHI EKWUEME	M	PDP	54	ADV. DIPLOM
12	50 50	COURT ORDER	OKONKWO ANNIE CLEMENT	M		55	HND
13	不不	LIUSI UNIUS	IGWILO MICHAEL C	M	PPA	60	MBA
14		The state of the s	IKECHUKWU FLINT OBIEKWE	M	LIPP	1 00	interpolation of the second se
15		the state of the s			-		
<del></del>		And the second s	ENGR. ERNEST CHUKWUKA NDUKWE	M	APGA	66	BSC, DSC
	£	S ANAMBRA SOUTH	bason Engrer CHIKWIKA NUUKWE	F	ACCORD	45	WAEC

LEE AMAECHI ANVERECETARY

DATED: 13TH JANUARY, 2015

MRS. AUGUSTA OGAKWU SECRETARY, INEC

	·	Large and the Artist of the Ar	MI	ACD	39	LLB (HONS), BL
3   -	The second secon	CHUKWUEMEKA CHUKWUMA	$+\frac{1}{M}$	AD	52	GCE
	The state of the s	OTTLIOSEPH		ADC	49	DIPLOMA
5		PRINCESS JEMIMA EZÉ-ILONDU	1 - 1	APC	61	BSC
		ETHELOBIAKOR		CPP	35	DIPLOMA ·
27	Lappropriate Management Control of the Control of t	OFORDUM IFEANYLANTHONY	-1 $M$ $-1$	And the state of t	43	UKNOWN
6	Western With the state of the s	OTTI CHRISTIAN IKECHUKWU	M		66	LLB, BL
8	And the state of t	NWOSU BENSON CHUKWUMEZIE	1 M	LP	- Impart	SSCE
2	The same of the sa	SIR PETER OKALA	M	NCF	48	LLB, BL, M.SC
10	Water State of the	EMEKA MARK GEORGE OSUNKWO	. M	PDC	1 51	California by Ca
	TO STORY OF THE STATE OF THE ST	UBAH CHUKWUNEDUM C.	M	PDP	57	WAEC
12	COURT ORDER	ODIGBO CHUKWUDI	M	PPA	49	WAEC
13		DR. IGWILO SYLVESTER	M	UPP	50	BSC
14		CHUKWUELOKE M.		enterior District the April Specific Lines.	1	The same of the sa

Certified True Copy					<b>;</b>	
OSCAR-LEE AMAECHI						
ADMINISTRATIVE SECRETARY INSC, ANAMBRA STATE	1	~	٠.			1
DATE	1		02	- <del></del> -	2	15
SIGN.	Letuno					. <u>L.</u> 

DATED: UTILIANUARY, 2015

Signed: (M. C. W. Signed: MRS. AUGUSTA C. DGAKWU SECRETARY, INEC

and the second s	The state of the s				46	B.SC, MPA
		CHURSENWOSU EMEKA SYLVESTER	. M	APGA.	40	the state of the s
ANAMB	RA AGUATA	ONY EMOBI OCHIAGHA	- M	. LP }	46	BL
		CHUCKUNWIKE	1			SSCE
1	The second secon	- PRANTIFEANYI	M	ID I	35	WAEC
	and the same and t	NWOKIKE PHILOMINA	. F	UPP	37	BSC
	And the second s	IFEMEJE KENECHUK WU	. M	·NCP	63	MPA
	Name of the state	OKOYE ANGELA NDIDI	F	PPA	44	WAEC
	NAME AND DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PR	NWAFOR CHINYERE	F	ADC	49	WAEC
		IAPOLONIA UZONDU	F	APC	Comment of the last of the las	B.A
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	OKOYE OBINNA FRANCIS	М	· PDC	36	BA, MA
		OFFIAH ANTHONY CHUKWUDI	M	PDP	49	SSCE
	COURT ORDER	MRS OTUMEMENA ONYINYECHI	F	ACCORD	46	347 F.
		WIFO OI CHARLESTAN			A saludane, as a product to the rains of	water and the state of the stat
		The state of the s	1	la company de la		بالعبار ميعاند جيهي فيده معجيب الإفسالات بعدييت فيدلا ومأد ديدي والبوط العثال مستهذا فا
	And the state of t	ODUMEGWU-OJUKWU	1	APGA	49	B.SC
	NNEW! NORTH	CHUKWUEMEKA	M	1	-	ere a
-	SOUTH/EKWUSIGO	OBI OBIORA ONYEABOR	M	L.P	40	B.A NCE
		ANAZODO STELLA ENUMA	F	UPP.	35	the state of the s
		BARR. IFEANYI EJIOFOR	1. M	UDP	39	LLB, BL
Į.	A STATE OF THE STA	BARR PERMITENTON	1 M	ADC ·	50	WASC
		RUDE OGUESIOFOR	M	APC	58	B.A
		HON, PHILIP OBIORA AGBASI	TF	ACD :	32	BSC
7	registration of the second sec	JULIETH NKECHI UBOZOR	M	PDF <sup>2</sup>	51	HND
8 8	COURTORDER	JULIUS OFORMA O.	F	ACCORD	40	DIPLOMA
0		IUSTINA IFEOMA OKEKE	1			The second secon
1		The state of the s				the party of the same of the s
		MOMAH CHUDY, IFEANYI MARK	М	APGA	. 36	
1	IHIALA	CHUDY			3, 13 ,	MBA
	The second secon	CHINNE THEODORE ALBERT	]. M	UPP	60	WAEC
2	The state of the s	NGOBILI MATTHEW	M	- PPA	411	WASC
3	The state of the s	EMMANUEL IKEMEFUNA	M			B.SC, MBA
4	The state of the s	HON, FORT IFEANYI DIKE	M	APC	50	B.A. PH.D
5		ANOHU CHUK WUEMEKA	M	PDP	43	WAEC
6	COURT ORDER	MRS NWANKWO CATHERINE	F	ACCORD	-41	WALC
7		SALVO SALARIAN SA COLOR CONTRACTOR				The state of the s

Certified True Copy FIRATIVE SECRETARY ARRASTATE

= 10-02-2015

DATE: 13TH JANUARY, 2015

Signed: (ALGAU)

MRS. AUGUSTA E. OGAKWU

SECRETARY, INEC

	The state of the s	The second secon				
11	AOCHA/NJIKOKA/DUNUK	NWANKWO DOZIE FERDINAND	М	APGA	39	B.SC
OF	The second secon	ILOUNOH AFAMEFUNA	M	LP	48	LLB
2 - 7	And the second s	DONATUS EGBUNA NWABUEZE	M	UPP	61	BSC
3	Name and Associated As	CHINWE NWAFOR	·F	UDP	36	BSC
. 4	The state of the s	EZE KINGSLEY	М	PPA	41	WASC
5	The state of the s	HON, ANEKWE IKENNA	- M	ADC	49	WASC
61		BARR CYRIAN UDENWA	M	APC	54	-WAEC, LLB, BL, LLM
	Married Married Control of the Contr	HON, VAL AYIKA	M	· PDP	49	HSC
E CC	OURT ORDER	FRUN, VAL ATRIOT	ħ1	ACCORD	40	SSCE
9	Opening promphosony of the burney of the promphoson of the burney of the	HON: UMERIE UCHENNA SUNDAY	24.			
	And the state of t				to d	LLB
	AMBRA EAST/WEST	MADUBUEZE PETER OBIANO	M.	APGA .	56	SSCE
The state of the s	A 19 E IF PACE ESTADA CONTRA A	NWOSU EMMANUEL	M	ID.	39	Jack Dark
3		ONWUBE RAPHAEL NWABUNWANNE	M	UPP	_53	WAEC
	And the state of t	OKONKWO CHUK WUEMEKA P.	M	PPA	49	WASC
4		OBIORA UCHENNA ANTHONY	M	ADC	30	WASC
5	The state of the s	GABRIEL CHIDOZIE GINIKA	M	APC	52	WAEC, LLB, BE
6	The second secon	NWENE EJIKE KENNETH	M	PDP	50	MBBS, MPH
7 7 00	OURT ORDER	NWENE EIKE KENNETH	**************************************			The state of the s
		And the Control of th	·			A CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH
and the state of t	The same of the sa	IGWEBUIKE IFEANYI HYGERS	M	APGA	49	B.SC
And the second lives of th	CUMBA NORTH/SOUTH	ESIOBU BELONWU IKECHUKWU	M	LP	64	B.SC
2	The state of the s	LIKATUNONSO	M	10	38	SSCE
3		FAMAR JOSEPH OKECHUKWU	·M	UPP	28	WAEC
44 Temperatura (1973)	The state of the s	GILBERT EZEIGWE	M	ADC	54	WASC
	The state of the s		F	APC	44	WASC
6	Program of the second s	EBELE OKEREKE		PDC	38	WAEC
47 To -	Company of the Compan	PRINCE ISAAC ONUKA	M	PDP	54	B.SC, M.SM
8 CAC	JURT ORDER -	UCHE IFEOMA OBI	F	ACCORD	22	NCE
99	the little and the little and the second	ONWUMERE LETICIA AMECHI	- 4"	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	And the state of t	The state of the s
The state of the second of the second	Company of the Compan		2.5	APGA	38	M.SC
Calvie Programme ID	EMILI NORTH/SOUTH	IBEZLIFEANYICHUKWU ANTHONY	·M	I APP	43	NCE .
	All the second of the second	CHIDEBE NICODEMUS CHIBLINNA	M	1 ULL	1	

Certified Trile Copy

OSGAR-LEE AMAEGH

ADMINISTRATIVE SECRETARY

ADMINISTRATIVE SECRETARY

DATE: ISTH JANUARY, 2015

Signed: (N) AU MRS. AUGUSTA Ç. OGAKWU SECRETARY, INEC

					nes a	38	TIMD
-31-	(A)		OPILI ELOCHUKWU	M	PPA	The state of the s	WASC
<u> </u>		A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR	ADIBE ONYINYE CHINAGOROM	F.	ADC	. 39	Remote the Comment of
5	**************************************	A the same and the	CHIBUZOR OBIAKOR	M	APC	54	WAEC B.SC
6	HORSE WHEN THE THE	The second section with the second section sec	OKAFOR NKIRU ROSEMARY-	F	AĆD	35	NCE
7	- 100	COURT ORDER	HON. CHARLES ODEDO	, M	PDP .	58	B.SC
<u>/</u> 8		CANAL CARACTER CONTRACTOR CONTRAC	IGBOEKWE INNOCENT CHIMBUDIKE	M	ACCORD	49	BA FRENCH
9	MENTAL POPULATION TO THE ADMINISTRA	A STATE OF THE STA			And the second s		
	····	The second secon	Control and the big and the adoption of the second of the			a hough the standard people of the London of the Standard Standard Standard Standard Standard Standard Standard	100
1		AWKA NORTH/SOUTH	EZENAGU GODSON CHUKWUMA	M	APGA	62	HND
[]	***************************************	ATTEMPTORING	MODEZIE KENNETH EJIKE	M	MPPP	56	PGDM
2	<del>,</del>	The state of the s	MUOGBO CHIDUBEM	M	ID [	32	SSCE
5	4) <del>(111 - 112 - 112 - 112 - 112 - 112</del>		ONUORAH UCHENNA HELEN	F	NNPP	. 34	DIPLOMA
1		The state of the s	NNEBEDUM NWEKE C. FABIAN	M	UPP	55	HND
3	material de la company	The second secon	CHIEF MICHAEL OZOEMENA	M	UDP	40	BSC
5		the state of the s	OZOEMENA MICHAEL C.	M	ADC	46	B.PHARM
7	·		CHUKWUEMEKA E. NWOGBO	M	APC.	54	HND
8	<del>46)************************************</del>	THE RESERVE THE PROPERTY OF TH	MADEBO VICTOR CINGBOGU	M	· PDC	43	l B.SC
21			GLORIA OBY OZOEMENA	17	ACD	47	NCE
3		and the same of th	HON. EMMA NWEKE	M	PDP	58	B.SC
1		COURT ORDER	CHINWEZE IFEOMA THERESA	F	ACCORD	27	SSCE
2			CTHY WILL II LANGE 1111. OLDEN				
			The state of the s		1		
		Constitution of the Consti	NWAEBILI CLARE CHINWE	F	ĀPGA	43	BSC
1	*	OGBARU	EDEMUZOR CHINEZIE ERNEST	M	UPP	32	BBC
21		The state of the s	and the second s	M	NCP	35	HND
31		And the second s	OKEKE DONATUS	M	PPA	33	NCE
4		The state of the s	NWAOGWDGWJE JONATHAN	M	ADC	47	WASC
5			OKAFOR EMEKA ELIAS	M	APC	54	PGD
6		The lates of the l	VICTOR A. OGHENE	M	PDP	56	WASC
7	73	COURT ORDER	BENEDICT O. OBAZE	F F	ACCORD	74	SSCE
8			MRS. ORIZU P. MILCHAN	r	- MINIMA	25-7	The state of the s
And Princeton	330						The second secon
	The second secon	CARTESTA SIGNETTI APPETEL	TABANSI-OKOYE ANTHONIA	F.	APGA	55	BL, LLB
1		ONITSHA NORTH/SOUTH	EKWUTOŚI		F 1 F 1 P 2	59	BSC
247	21.000000000000000000000000000000000000	The state of the s	REV. PATRICK O. ACHUKWU	M	UPP	was a supplied of the supplied	DND
210	(nhu	F4	ENENMUOH EMEKA	M	ADC	45	WAEC
4	LJ		EKWE RITA N.	F	APC 1	50	I WALL

OSCAR-LEEAWAECH ADMINISTRATIVE SECRETARY INEC, ANAMBRA STATE

DATE: ISTH JANUARY, 2015

Signed: WESA C. OGAKWU
SECRETARY, INEC

	DANIEL IKECHUK WU MUOK WNE OKAGBUE UCHENNA DAVID IBUZO ANTHONY OGUEROFOR IFEYINWA ANAZONWU	M         ACD           M         ACPI           M         ACCO           F         PDE	N 51 RD 49	B.SC B.SC, FCIA B.A (AGRIC) BSC
8 COURT ORDER  1 OYVAYAMELUM	ONYENWIFE GABRIEL OKOYE MRS. MBAMALU CECILIA NWAUGO VURGINIA E. MEZUE	M APG F APC M PD	C 53 C 45 P 49	LLB ND WAEC B.SC, MBA B.ED
COURT ORDER	IGNAY A.O. NWENE CHIGBO NWAKEGO FELICIA OKONKWO GORDIAN OBI	F ACCO	3.7	WAEC

Certified True	Copy				
OSCAR-LEE AM	AFCHI				16
EL TOUR TRAFILE CER	INCHI ANT ANT		¥/-		
ADMINISTRATIVE OF SINEC, ANAMBRAS	TATE	9		2015	
DATE		10-02			
SEGN:	18				
THE PARTY OF THE P					

DATE: 13TH JANUARY, 2015

Signed (LD) (L MRS: AUGUSTA C. OGAKWI SECRETARY, INEC

### IN THE FEDERAL HIGH COURT OF NIGERIA IN THE ABUJA JUDICIAL HEADQUARTER HOLDEN AT ABUJA

ON FRIDAY DAY THE 5<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF DECEEMBER, 2014 BEFORE HIS LORDSHIP, HONOURABLE JUSTICE E. S.CHUKWU JUDGE

SUIT NO: FHC/ABJ/CS/ 854/2014

#### BETWEEN:

1 EJIKE OGUEBEGO (Chairman P.D.P. Anambara State)

2 HON. CHUKS OKOYE

(Legal Adviser, PDP Anambra State Chapter)

(Suing for themselves and on behalf of the other members of the State Executive Committee of the PDP Anambra State.

PLAINTIFFS

#### AND

1 PEOPLES' DEMOCRATIC PARTY

9 ;

2 INDEPENDENT NATIONAL ELECTORAL COMMISSION (INEC)

**DEFENDANTS** 

## ORDER

UPON THIS CIVIL SUIT dated and filed on 17/11/2014 praying the Honourable Court for the following Reliefs:

1 A Declaration that the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant cannot legally and validly set up a caretaker committee or any other body whatsoever when the order of interlocutory injunction made by this Honourable Court in Suit No: FHC/PH/CS/213/2013 NOW Suit No. FHC/AWK/CS/247/2013- Ejike Oguebego & 2 Ors Vs Peoples' Democratic Party & 1 Ors (which order and Suit is also subject of pending appeal before the Port-Harcourt Judicial Division of the Court of Appeal in Suit No: CA/PH/764/2013-Peoples' Democratic Party Vs Ejike Oguebego & 3 Ors) is still subsisting and subject of an Appeal.

HON. JUSTICE E.S. CHUKWU

JUDGE

CERTIFIED TRUE COPY FEDERAL HIGH COURT

- Signature on the Aculoch

200263300

- 2 A Declaration that the purported Caretaker Committee set up by the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant is an illegal and unconstitutional body when the tenure of the Ejike Oguebego led State Executive Committee of the People's Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter which will only lapse on the 16<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2016 is still subsisting, functioning and duly recognised by the Court and the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant.
- A Declaration that the acts, decisions and any delegate list or nominated candidates that may emanate from the congresses and primaries conducted by the caretaker committee set up by the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant is illegal, invalid, unconstitutional and therefore null and void and of no effect whatsoever nor can the said list be used for any purpose for the conduct of the 2015 General Election with regard to Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter.
  - 4 An Order of this Honourable Court that the Defendants in this case are bound to recognise, deal with and accept the list of delegates and nominated candidates that may emanate from the congresses and primaries conducted by the Plaintiff in this Case.
  - 5 An Order of Perpetual Injunction restraining the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant, its agents, servants, privies, assigns, officials whatsoever name they may be called from forwarding, sending or submitting to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant any delegates list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or primaries conducted by the purported caretaker committee set up by the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anamabra State Chapter except those that emanate from the Plaintiffs' congresses and primaries election.

CERTIFIED TRUE COPY
FEDERAL HIGH COURY
A BU JA

. 0 :

6 An Order of Perpetual Injunction restraining the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant, its agents, servants, privies, assigns, officials whatsoever name they may be

called from accepting or receiving any delegate list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or primaries conducted by the caretaker committee set up by the 1st Defendant for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter except those that emanate from the Plaintiffs.

- 7 An Order of this Honourable Court that the 1st Defendant - Peoples' Democratic Party by the purported appointment of a caretaker committee to oversee, run the affairs and conduct elections for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter is in flagrant disobedience and contempt of the Order of this Honourable Court made by Hon. Justice E.S. Chukwu on the 10<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2014 and re-24<sup>th</sup> in the affirmed on No:FHC/ABJ/CS/680/2014 - Ken Emeakayi Vs Peoples' Democratic Party & 6 Ors.
  - 8 An Order of this Honourable Court disbanding, nullifying and setting aside the illegal caretaker committee set up by the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant to oversee, run the affairs and conduct the elections for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter.
  - 9 An Order of this Honourable Court re-affirming the Order of Interlocutory Injunction given in Suit No: FHC/PH/CS/213/2013 (NOW Suit No: FHC/AWK/CS/247/2013) Ejike Oguebego & 2 Ors Vs Peoples' Democratic Party & 3 Ors pending the hearing and determination of the Appeal before the Port-Harcourt Judicial Division of the Court of Appeal in Suit No: CA/PH/764/2013-Peoples' Democratic Party Vs Ejike Oguebego & 3 Ors.

4

AND AFTER READING the affidavit in support of the Originating Summons filed on 17/11/2014 and sworn to by MR OLORUNSOGO OLUSOJI

JOHN, Male, Christian, Adult, Nigerian Citizen and of No. 14 James Brown Street, Gwarimpa Abuja together with a written address in support of the Plaintiffs Originating Summons with Exhibit attached thereto both dated and filed 17/11/2014 at this Court's Registry.

AND AFTER HEARING TAIWO ABE ESQ, appears for the Plaintiff and prayed the Court to enter Judgment as per the Reliefs Sought by the Plaintiff.

AND AFTER HEARING CHIEF SOLO AKUMA, SAN, appears with MAURIN EZE (MISS) and UCHENNA OGUNEDO (MISS) for the 1<sup>st</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> Defendants opposing the Reliefs Sought by the Plaintiff.

AND AFTER HEARING CHIEF OLUSOLA OKE ESQ. appears with EMENIKE IKORO ESQ and OLUWASEYI BAMGBOYE for the 1st Defendant opposing the Reliefs Sought by the Plaintiff.

AND AFTER HEARING ABDULAZEEZS ANI ESQ appears for the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant not opposing the Reliefs Sought by the Plaintiff.

AND AFTER HEARING ABDULAZEEZS ANI, ESQ appears for the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant not opposing the Reliefs Sought by the Plaintiff.

-01

AND AFTER HEARING ARTHUS, OBI OKAFOR SAN Appears with V.C OTAOKPUKPU ESQ, ANJORN OLAREWAJU. ESQ. for the 3<sup>rd</sup> Defendant.

AND ARTHUR OBI OKAFOR SAN opposing the reliefs sought by the Plaintiff's Counsel.

AND THE COURT HAVING GIVING ITS JUDGMENT THIS 5<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF DECEMBER, 2014.

CERTIFIED TRUE COPY
FEDERAL HIGH COURF
A B U J A
Signature

Signature en real and consequence

## IT IS HEREBY ORDERED AS FOLLOWS:

- 1 That it is hereby Ordered that the purported Caretaker Committee or ad hoc Committee set up by the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant during the subsistence and pending of this Suit is illegal, null and void.
- 2 That it is further ordered that any delegate list or nominated candidates that emanate from the congresses and primaries conducted by the caretaker committee or ad hoc committee set up by the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant during the pendency and subsistence of this Suit is illegal, invalid, unconstitutional, abuse of Court Process null and void and cannot be used for any purpose.
- 3 That the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant agent and privies are hereby restrained from forwarding, sending or submitting to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant any delegates list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or primaries conducted by the caretaker or ad hoc committee set up by the defendant for the Peoples' Democratic Party.
- 4 That the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant, its agents, servants, privies are restrained from forwarding, sending or submitting to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant any delegates list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or primaries conducted by the purported caretaker committee set up by the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anamabra State Chapter except those that emanate from the Plaintiffs' congresses and primaries election.

GERTIFIED TRUE COPY 5 FEDERAL HIGH COURT 5	
ADILA	
Cionatura 7710	
Datassandonspassassassas	

.4

That the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant, its agents, servants, privies, assigns, officials whatsoever name they may be called are restrained from

accepting or receiving any delegate list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or primaries conducted by the caretaker committee set up by the 1st Defendant for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter except those that emanate from the Plaintiffs.

6 That the 1<sup>st</sup> Defendant Peoples' Democratic Party by the purported appointment of a caretaker committee to oversee, run the affairs and conduct elections for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter is in flagrant disobedience and contempt of the Order of this Honourable Court made by Hon. Justice E.S. Chukwu on the 10<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2014 and re-affirmed on the 24<sup>th</sup> in Suit No:FHC/ABJ/CS/680/2014 — Ken Emeakayi Vs Peoples' Democratic Party & 6 Ors.

ISSUED AT ABUJA under the Seal of the Court and the Hand of the Presiding Judge, Hon, Justice E.S. CHUKWU this 5th day of December, 2014.

19.00

HASSAN C. SHEKARAH

REGISTRAR

water alian cenhinada Tauco hom lagacet

ABU

Signature.

(D) 22

# IN THE SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA HOLDEN AT ABUJA

# ON FRIDAY, THE 29TH DAY OF JANUARY, 2016

## BEFORE THEIR LORDSHIPS

NWALI SYLVESTER NGWUTA
MARY UKAEGO PETER-ODILI
OLUKAYODE ARIWOOLA
MUSA DATITIO MUHAMMAD
IOHN INYANG OKORO

IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT IUSTICE, SUPREME COURT

SC. 37/2015

## BETWEEN:-

EJIKE OGUEBEGO

2. HON. CHUKS OKOYE

(Chairman P.D.P. Anambra State and
Legal Adviser PDP Anambra State Chapter
respectively, suing for themselves and on
behalf of the other members of the State
Executive Committee of the PDP Anambra State)

APPELLANTS

### AND

- PEOPLES DEMOCRATIC PARTY
- 2. INDEPENDENT NATIONAL ELECTORAL COMMISSION (INEC)

CHUKWUDI OKASIA

RESPONDENTS

## <u>IUDGMENT</u>

(Delivered by JOHN INYANG OKORO, JSC)

This is an appeal against the judgment of the Court of Appeal, Abuja Division delivered on the 6th of February,

2015. In it, the lower court allowed the appeal of the 1st Respondent herein from the judgment of the Federal High Court, Abuja Division presided over by E. S. Chukwu, J, delivered on the 15th day of December, 2014. In order to appreciate the issues thrown up for the determination of this appeal, an understanding of the complicated facts of this case is *sine qua non*. I shall, as much as is practicable, summarize the facts as can be gleaned from the three volumes of the record of appeal.

The Anambra State Executive Committee of the Peoples Democratic Party (PDP for short), led by the 1st appellant was elected into office on the 7th day of March, 2012 at the State congress election convened for that purpose. The election was duly monitored by the Independent National Electoral Commission. The said Commission later wrote Exhibit E found on pages 33 – 34 of Volume 1 of the record of appeal recognizing both the congress and the executive committee emerging therefrom.

However, sometime in March, 2012, one Emma Mbamalu, alleging himself to be the Acting Chairman of the PDP, commenced an action at the High Court of the Federal Capital Territory in Suit No. FCT/CV/2631/2012 - Emma Mbamalu Vs PDP, to which none of the members of the 1st appellant's led state executive committee of the PDP was joined. Judgment was entered in favour of the Plaintiff in that suit nullifying PDP Wards, local government and state congresses held on 3rd and 7th, 10th and 17th March, 2012 respectively. No order was however made against the Ejike Oguebego - led Anambra State Executive, not having made parties to the case. Records show that even when the appellants herein sought to join in the said suit as parties likely to be affected or interested party, the said court refused their application, stating that they had no interest in the matter as constituted.

When an attempt was made by certain elements in the PDP to recognize one Ken Emeakayi (a former State

Executive Chairman of PDP Anambra State Chapter), and his associates as the authentic PDP Executive Committee for Anambra State, the 1st and 2nd appellants herein, as members of the INEC-recognized Ejike Oguebego - led executive committee filed an action (during the annual vacation) at the Port Harcourt Judicial Division of the Federal High Court in Suit No. FHC/PH/CS/213/2014 now Suit No. FHC/AWK/CS/247/2014. The action was brought in representative capacity such that all the members of the Anambra PDP Executive Committee were parties to the case.

On 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2013, the Federal High Court, presided over by Hon. Justice H. A. Ngajiwa ordered the PDP to maintain the *status quo ante bellum*, which is that the Ejike Oguebego-led State Executive Committee is the authentic PDP Anambra State Executive. Part of the order of the said court can be found on pages 22 – 24 of Volume I of the record of appeal as follows:

"That the 1st and 2nd defendants are hereby ordered to recognize and deal with the plaintiffs in all election matters in Anambra state pending the hearing and determination of the substantive matter."

The 1st respondent herein appealed against the said order of the Federal High Court to the Court of Appeal in Appeal No. CA/PH/764/2013. The notice of appeal can be found at pages 25 – 28 of Volume I of the record of appeal. As at the time this appeal was taken, that appeal was still pending before the Court of Appeal.

Mr. Ken Emeakanyi commenced another action in the Federal High Court, Abuja in Suit No. FHC/ABJ/CS/680/2014 claiming to still be the Chairman of PDP Anambra State Chapter. The said suit was dismissed by E. S. Chukwu, J. of the Federal High Court, Abuja.

When the 1st respondent, during the pendency of the orders of the Federal High Court and Exhibit E written by INEC, set up a caretaker committee to run the affairs

of PDP, Anambra State Chapter, the present appellants being persons affected by the said act of the 1st respondent, approached the Federal High Court by way of an originating summons dated and filed on the 17th of November, 2014, presented the following questions for determination, namely:

- Whether in view of the subsisting and binding order of interlocutory injunction made by this Honourable Court in No. FHC/PH/CS/213/2013) (now Suit FHC/AWK/CS/247/2013) - Ejike Oguebego & 2 Ors VS. Peoples' Democratic Party & Anor (which order and suit is also subject of pending appeal before the Port Harcourt Judicial Division of the Court of Appeal in Suit No. CA/PH/764/2013 - Peoples' Democratic Party VS. Ejike Oguebego & 3 Ors) the 1st Defendant can validly set up a caretaker committee to run, or oversee the affairs or conduct any delegate election or primaries of the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter.
- 2. Whether the caretaker committee set up by the 1st

Defendant is not an illegal and unconstitutional body when the tenure of the Ejike Oguebego led state executive committee is still subsisting functioning and duly recognized by the court and the 2<sup>nd</sup> Defendant.

- 3. Whether the acts, decisions and any delegate list or nominated candidates that may emanate from the congresses and primaries conducted by the caretaker committee set up by the 1st defendant is not illegal, invalid, unconstitutional and therefore null and void and of no effect whatsoever nor can the said list be used for any purpose for the conduct of the 2015 general election.
- 4. Whether the defendants in this case are not bound to recognize and accept the list of delegates and nominate candidates that may emanate from the congresses and primaries conducted by the Plaintiff in this case.

The plaintiffs then sought the following reliefs from the Federal High Court, namely:

1. A DECLARATION that the 1st defendant cannot legally and validly set up a caretaker committee or any other

body whatsoever when the order of interlocutory injunction made by this Honourable Court in Suit No. FHC/PH/CS/213/2013 now Suit No. FHC/AWK/CS/247/2013 - Ejike Oguebego & 2 Ors. VS. Peoples' Democratic Party & 1 Or (which order and suit is also subject of pending appeal before the Port Harcourt Judicial Division of the Court of Appeal in CA/PH/764/2013 - Peoples' Democratic Party VS Ejike Oguebego & 3 Ors). is still subsisting and subject of an appeal.

- 2. A DECLARATION that the caretaker committee set up by the 1st defendant is an illegal and unconstitutional body when the tenure of the Ejike Ognebego led state executive committee is still subsisting, functioning and duly recognized by the court and the 2nd defendant.
- 3. A DECLARATION that the acts, decisions and any delegate list or nominated candidates that may emanate from the congresses and primaries conducted by the caretaker committee set up by the 1st defendant is illegal,

invalid, unconstitutional and therefore null and void and of no effect whatsoever nor can the said list be used for any purpose for the conduct of the 2015 general election with regard to the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter.

- 4. AN ORDER OF THIS HONOURABLE COURT that the defendants in this case are bound to recognize and accept the list of and nominated candidates that may emanate from the congresses and primaries conducted by the plaintiff in this case.
- 5. AN ORDER OF PERPETUAL INJUNCTION restraining the 2nd defendant, its agents, servants, privies, assigns, officials whatsoever name they may be called from accepting or receiving any delegates list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or primaries conducted by the caretaker committee set up by the 1st defendant for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter except those that emanate from the Plaintiffs.

After full trial and fully hearing the parties and considering the totality of the evidence before it, the trial court granted the reliefs sought in the following terms as contained at pages 851 – 853 of Volume 2 of the record of appeal, as follows:-

- 1. It is hereby ordered that the purported caretaker committee or Ad-hoc Committee set up by the 1st defendant during the subsistence and pendency of this suit is illegal, null and void.
- 2. It is further ordered that any delegate list or nominated candidates that emanate from the congresses and primaries conducted by the caretaker Committee or Ad-hoc Committee set up by the 1st defendant during the pendency and subsistence of this suit is illegal, invalid, unconstitutional, abuse of court process, null and void and cannot be used for any purpose.
- 3. The 1<sup>st</sup> defendant, agents and privies are hereby restrained from forwarding, sending or submitting to the 2<sup>nd</sup> defendant any delegates' list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or

- primaries conducted by the Caretaker Committee set up by the 1st defendant for the PDP.
- 4. That the 1st defendant, its agents, servants, privies are restrained from forwarding, sending or submitting to the 2nd defendant any delegates list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or primaries conducted by the purported caretaker committee set up by the 1st defendant for the Peoples' Democratic Party, Anambra State Chapter except those that emanate from the plaintiffs' congresses and primaries election.
- 5. That the 2<sup>nd</sup> defendant, its agents, servants, privies, assigns, officials whatsoever name they may be called are restrained from accepting or receiving any delegate list or nominated candidates that may emerge from the congresses or primaries conducted by the caretaker committee set up by the 1<sup>st</sup> defendant for the Peoples' Democratic Party Anambra State Chapter except those that emanate from the plaintiffs.